## 9

### **A TSQL2 Tutorial**

# R. T. Snodgrass, I. Ahn, G. Ariav, D. Batory, J. Clifford, C. E. Dyreson, R. Elmasri, F. Grandi, C. S. Jensen, W. Käfer, N. Kline, K. Kulkarni, T. Y. C. Leung, N. Lorentzos, J. F. Roddick, A. Segev, M. D. Soo, and S. M. Sripada

#### **1** Introduction

This tutorial presents the primary constructs of the consensus temporal query language TSQL2 via a media planning scenario. *Media planning* is a series of decisions involved in the delivery of a promotional message via mass media.

We will follow the planning of a particular advertising campaign. We introduce the scenario by identifying the marketing objective. The media plan involves placing commercials, and is recorded in a temporal database. The media plan must then be evaluated; we show how TSQL2 can be used to derive information from the stored data. We then give examples that illustrate storing and querying indeterminate information, comparing multiple versions of the media plan, accommodating changes to the schema, and vacuuming a temporal database of old data.

#### 2 The Context

When Miller Brewing Company introduced Lite Beer, it revolutionized the beer industry. Once thought of as weak and feminine, low-calorie beer became the drink of choice for many consumers in the most lucrative market—males who drink large quantities of beer<sup>1</sup>. Not to miss a profitable opportunity, Anheuser-Busch introduced Bud Light, which had fewer calories than its regular beer, Budweiser. The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Miller's commercials, involving various sports celebrities arguing "Less Filling" versus "Tastes Great," were critical in achieving this positioning.

new beer was intended to compete with Lite Beer from Miller<sup>2</sup>.

From a promotional standpoint, there were two major tasks: to link the new brand to the established image of its flagship brand, Budweiser, and to differentiate Bud Light from Lite Beer from Miller.

Anheuser-Busch was committed to giving Bud Light the support necessary to become a leading contender in the light beer category. But to compete with the phenomenonally successful Lite Beer, it would be necessary to achieve high brand awareness, and quickly. This would require the promotional media plan to achieve broad reach and high impact<sup>3</sup>.

Commercials during the Super Bowl (the professional U.S. football championship game) met these requirements admirably. The Super Bowl is among the most watched television events of each year<sup>4</sup>.

To ensure high impact, the commercials mirror the football game. A team composed of bottles of Budweiser "competes" against a team composed of bottles of Bud Light, with one commercial each quarter of the game. It was hoped that the series of four commercials would be highly memorable and generate high excitement, and would help to link the Bud Light brand to Budweiser in the consumers' minds. Another benefit was its potential for promotional tie-ins.

Anheuser-Busch faced the challenge of integrating the Super Bowl commercials for Bud Light with ongoing promotion for both Budweiser and for Bud Light, which involved heavy TV coverage. This would involve generating a comprehensive media plan.

A *media plan* is a set of specific media objectives (in this case, increase brand awareness of Bud Light), and specific media strategies that determine which spots should be shown when and on which vehicles<sup>5</sup>. While media planning involves all media, including radio, print, in-store promotions, etc., this scenario only concerns television. We show how the development of a media plan for Bud Light marketing can be supported by TSQL2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>You may recall the TV commercials. A person walks up to a bar and asks for a "light." Instead of getting a beer, he gets a spotlight, or a candle, or a match, making a pun on the word "light." In another series of commercials, the original 'party animal,' Spuds MacKenzie, was created to personify the attitude of the Bud Light drinker.

 $<sup>{}^{3}</sup>Reach$  is the percentage of the target market that is exposed to the message. A broad reach is a high reach across a large, undifferentiated target market.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>The Super Bowl has been the occasion for several highly memorable ads, which many believe was initiated by Apple Corporation's "1984" ad on the Apple II computer, recently voted the best ad of the decade, and the subsequent "Lemmings" commercial of 1985 introducing the Apple MacIntosh computer. The MasterLock ad in which a rifle bullet is shot into a lock is aired only one time a year, during the Super Bowl, yet many people still recall seeing that ad.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>A *vehicle* refers a specific carrier within a medium category, such as a specific TV show; "Star Trek: The Next Generation" is a television vehicle.

#### **3** Recording the Media Plan in a Temporal Database

Most of the tables needed for media planning will be time-varying tables. One table will record the costs of commercials.

```
CREATE TABLE NBCShows
(ShowName CHARACTER ( 30 ) NOT NULL,
InsertionLength INTERVAL SECOND,
Cost INTEGER)
AS VALID STATE YEAR ( 2 ) TO NBCSeason ;
```

ShowName is the name of a program on NBC (NBC is a television network). InsertionLength is the duration of a commercial (termed an *insertion*) shown during the program, and Cost is the price in dollars of the advertisement.

This statement differs from an SQL-92 statement in the AS VALID clause. This construct identifies the NBCShows table as a *valid-time state table*, recording information that changes in reality. Such tables contain rows that are timestamped by *valid-time elements*, which are sets of *periods*, which are themselves anchored durations of time. We'll give an example shortly of the contents of this table.

This statement mentions three *granularities*, which are partitionings of the time line. SECOND and YEAR are two granularities available in SQL-92. NBC-Season partitions each year into 3 distinct seasons, which start at different times in different years<sup>6</sup>. TSQL2 allows the database administrator to define new *calendars*, which provide one or more granularities. Calendars can also be made available by the DBMS vendor or a third party.

Each period (interval, datetime) has an associated *range*, the maximum time that can be represented, and an underlying granularity. Here we specify that the granularity be NBCSeason. We specify a range of 100 years, via the syntax "YEAR (2)", which indicates  $10^2$  years. At three seasons a year, periods can be represented in a 32-bit word.

Commercials in the media plan are recorded in the table.

```
INSERT INTO NBCShows
```

```
VALUES ('Roseanne', INTERVAL '30' SECOND, 251000)
VALID TIMESTAMP 'Spring Season 1994';
```

For the row that is inserted, the value of the InsertionLength is 30 seconds<sup>7</sup>. The timestamp is specified as a single season. Note that this literal is interpreted by a calendar, in this case, the NBC\_calendar. TSQL2 permits limited

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>Networks choose the start of each season very carefully. Some start early, to give their new shows more prominence; others delay the start believing that audiences are larger later in the year.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>For the purpose of this tutorial, we assume that *Roseanne* is on NBC (it is an ABC show). *Roseanne* is one of the most expensive shows on which to advertise, at over half a million dollars a minute. In comparison, the CBS show *60 minutes* costs \$314,000 a minute, CBS's *Late Show with David Letterman* costs \$64,000 a minute, and CNN prime time costs only \$2,400 a minute.

extensibility, in terms of user-defined calendars and granularities. Presumably NBC provided this calendar, for use in media-planning activities.

The literal INTERVAL '30' SECOND, which has an underlying granularity of SECOND, is interpreted by the SQL92 calendar, which is provided for conformity with the SQL-92 standard.

**ShowName** *InsertionLength* Cost Valid Time 'Roseanne' '30' SECOND 251000 'Spring Season 1994' '60' 1800000 'Super Bowl' SECOND 'Spring 1994' Season

Figure 1 shows a portion of the rows of this table.

Figure	1.	Two	Rows	of the	NRCShows	Table
riguit	1.	IWU	NUWS	or the	<b>IND</b> CONOWS	Table

The media plan itself specifies a collection of commercials (insertions) into each vehicle over a period of time, and may also include specific individual insertions.

```
CREATE TABLE NBC_FB_Insertion
(GameName CHARACTER ( 30 ),
InsertionWindow INTERVAL FootballSegment,
InsertionLength INTERVAL SECOND ( 3, 0 ),
CommercialID CHARACTER ( 30 ) )
```

AS VALID EVENT YEAR ( 2 ) TO HOUR AND TRANSACTION ;

This table records a particular insertion purchase, for a particular football game broadcast in a particular hour on NBC. Commercials for football games are often sold for particular game quarters<sup>8</sup>. The InsertionWindow specifies which quarter the commercial is to appear in, and is relative to the start of the game. For this, we use another user-defined granularity, specific to the kind of game, rather than the network (there might be other granularities for games with halves, such as basketball, or games with commercials only at the half, such as soccer). Here, the InsertionLength has an underlying granularity of SECOND, and a range of  $10^3 = 1000$  seconds.

The AS clause indicates that this is a *bitemporal event table*, with both validtime support (the timestamp indicates which day the show airs) and transaction-time support. The EVENT reserved word indicates that rows are timestamped with sets of datetimes (specifically, DATES), rather than periods, as in the previous example. Here the timestamps are to the underlying granularity of HOUR, with a range of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup>The Super Bowl is sold in terms of the four quarters, as well as the pregame, half-time, and postgame shows. Ironically, pricing is not determined by quarters. Advertisers generally prefer the first quarter, as the audience is most attentive then, but those slots are grabbed early by big advertisers. Recently, NBC sold overtime options, which were to be used only if the game went into overtime. The reasoning of the advertisers is that the viewers will be maximally attentive during that time, though there is also the probability that the commercial will not run.

100 years (requiring only one 32-bit word). The *transaction time* is the time the fact is stored in the database. In this case, the table supports multiple versions of the media plan. The DBMS supplies the range and underlying granularities for transaction timestamps.

Anheuser-Busch purchased four one-minute commercials for the 1994 Super Bowl, at \$1,800,000 each, as well as a short commercial for Bud Ice Draft, for a total cost of \$7,650,000, see Figure 2.

GameName	InsertionWindow	InsertionLength	•••
'Super Bowl'	'First Quarter'	'60' SECOND	
'Super Bowl'	'Second Quarter'	'60' SECOND	
'Super Bowl'	'Third Quarter'	'60' SECOND	• • •
'Super Bowl'	'Fourth Quarter'	'60' SECOND	
'Super Bowl'	'Third Quarter'	'15' SECOND	

• • •	CommercialID	Valid Time	
	'Naked reverse good for TD'	'1994-01-30 13'	
	'Basher is ejected'	'1994-01-30 13'	
•••	'Wind reverses Light pass'	'1994-01-30 13'	
	'Blimps move Bud Bowl to bar'	'1994-01-30 13'	
	'Frosty Bottle'	'1994-01-30 13'	

Figure 2: The NBC\_FB\_Insertion Table

The football calendar interprets the literal INTERVAL 'Second Quarter'; the datetime literal '1994-01-30 13' is interpreted by the SQL92 calendar. The DBMS supplies the transaction time when rows are inserted or updated. The transaction time is not shown in the table, due to lack of space.

#### 4 Evaluating the Media Plan

Once a media plan is in place, it must be evaluated. We provide some representative queries, chosen to illustrate novel features of TSQL2 which are useful in this application.

One question that arises is how well the media plans for the two beer brands have been integrated. Too many commercials in a single show does not increase the effective reach (although it does increase frequency, which is linked to memorability).

**Example 1** List those football games broadcast by NBC that have two or more commercials.

SELECT N.GameName FROM NBC\_FB\_Insertion AS N N2 WHERE N.GameName = N2.GameName AND N.CommercialID <> N2.CommercialID

While this appears to be a straightforward SQL-92 query, in fact it is a temporal query, evaluated over a bitemporal event relation, with the result being a valid-time event relation.

Two correlation names are defined, N and N2, and an implicit join is requested. Since the transaction time is not mentioned in the where clause, the information as best known now is retrieved. Erroneously stored information that was later corrected will not be retrieved.

The query also performs an implicit *valid-time selection*, requiring that rows associated with N and N2 be valid at the same time.

Finally, the query performs an implicit *valid-time projection*. The games that are returned will be associated with particular days, those days in which there were N and N2 rows that were concurrently valid.  $\Box$ 

We might want to advertise on long-running shows. Hence, we may want to know how long a show has been running. This information can be extracted from the temporal database.

**Example 2** How long has the Roseanne show run?

SELECT SNAPSHOT ShowName, CAST(VALID(N) TO INTERVAL DAY) FROM NBCShows(ShowName) AS N WHERE N.ShowName = 'Roseanne'

This query has three interesting constructs. The SNAPSHOT reserved word indicates that even though the query is defined on a time-varying table, the result is to be a conventional table. The (ShowName) found in the from clause requests that the underlying table, NBCShows, be *coalesced* on the ShowName attribute. Coalescing is similar to conventional projection. Like projection, coalescing makes only the specified columns available; unlike projection, it combines the row timestamps into a single timestamp. Only the ShowName column is considered; the timestamps for all rows with identical values for that column (termed *value-equivalent* rows) are combined into a single temporal element (set of periods). The CAST will then convert this set into a single INTERVAL of a granularity of DAY. This requires the NBC calendar to cast each period into a period of DAYs; then the DBMS determines the duration, the number of days, in the period. The durations of all of the periods are then totaled.

Queries involving contiguous periods are very common. For example, we may want to determine the well-established shows.

**Example 3** List all shows broadcast by NBC that ran continuously for at least two years, and indicate the day that they began that run.

```
SELECT ShowName
VALID CAST(BEGIN(VALID(A) AS DAY))
FROM NBCShows(ShowName)(PERIOD) AS A
WHERE CAST(VALID(A) AS INTERVAL YEAR) >=
    INTERVAL '2' YEAR
```

Here, the from clause coalesces on the ShowName column, but also specifies *partitioning* into maximal periods (via the (PERIOD) syntax). The valid-time element timestamp is partitioned into possibly many timestamps, each a single period, and the query is applied to each. Only those rows associated with periods of duration of at least two years are selected.

The VALID(A) construct will in this case return a single period. The starting instant is extracted by the BEGIN operator (there is also an END operator, and several other constructors), then that timestamp, at an underlying granularity of NBCSeason, is cast by the NBC calendar to a particular DAY, depending on when that season started.

The result is a valid-time event relation, with each row timestamped with an event set. Resulting rows are coalesced if the values of the columns are identical. If a particular show ran for two years, then was cancelled, then subsequently returned and ran again for at least two years, its timestamp will contain two events, the start of its first run and the start of its second run.  $\Box$ 

Coalescing can be combined in various ways with partitioning.

**Example 4** How long has the Roseanne show run, and how long did the cost remain constant?

```
SELECT SNAPSHOT ShowName,
   CAST(VALID(N) TO INTERVAL DAY),
   CAST(VALID(B) AS INTERVAL DAY)
FROM NBCShows(ShowName) AS N,
   N(Cost)(PERIOD) AS B
WHERE N.ShowName = 'Roseanne'
```

In this query, we define a correlation name B that is *coupled* with N. It inherits all of the coalescing columns of N, specifically ShowName, and adds another one, Cost. Additionally, B is partitioned into maximal (contiguous) periods.

Since B is defined in terms of N, it has the same values as N for those columns in common. Conceptually, B iterates over the costs of a particular show identified by N. Since B is partitioned into maximal periods, this correlation name identifies each period of constant cost for the particular show.  $\Box$ 

An important consideration in media planning is ensuring that the media budget is distributed properly over the media vehicles. Here, we examine how the budget distribution for commercials on football games on the three major networks varies over time, specifically the amount spent each month on each network. To compute this, we sum over all the insertions for a particular network, looking up the cost for the season the game resides in.

**Example 5** Give the monthly distribution over vehicles.

The corresponding TSQL2 query is displayed in Figure 3. The result will be a table with three dollar amounts per month.

```
SELECT SUM(NBCShows.Cost), SUM(ABCShows.Cost),
SUM(CBSShows.Cost)
FROM NBC_FB_Insertion AS N, NBCShows,
ABC_FB_Insertion AS A, ABCShows,
CBS_FB_Insertion AS C, CBSShows
WHERE N.GameName = NBCShows.ShowName AND
A.GameName = ABCShows.ShowName AND
C.GameName = CBSShows.ShowName AND
N.InsertionLength = NBCShows.InsertionLength AND
A.InsertionLength = ABCShows.InsertionLength AND
C.InsertionLength = CBSShows.InsertionLength AND
C.InsertionLength = CBSShows.InsertionLength AND
C.InsertionLength = CBSShows.InsertionLength AND
C.InsertionLength = CBSShows.InsertionLength
```

Figure 3: Monthly Distribution Over Vehicles

This query uses tables for the networks ABC and CBS that are analogous to those introduced earlier for NBC. Tables ABC\_FB\_Insertion and CBS\_FB\_Insertion are to the granularity of an HOUR, the ABCShows table is to the granularity of ABCSeason, and the CBSShows is to the granularity of CBSSeason. The associated calendars determine which days these seasons overlap, to determine which cost to use in computing the cost of a particular football insertion; the costs are then aggregated over each month, as specified by the group by clause, with the SQL92 calendar determining in which month each day occurs. The default transaction-time selection is to retrieve the known information, that is, the current media plan, rather than some previous version.

#### **5** Support for Indeterminacy

Often the marketing department will hear about the possible changes to the strategies of competitors, such as the impending introduction of a new light beer. Analyses then need to take this information into account.

The following table records the projected budgets of competing brands.

```
CREATE TABLE TVBudget

(Company CHARACTER ( 30 ) NOT NULL,

Brand CHARACTER ( 30 ),

Network CHARACTER ( 4 ),

AggregateBudget INTEGER)

VALID STATE NONSTANDARD INDETERMINATE

YEAR(2) TO MONTH ;
```

Since the marketing department cannot be sure when a competitor's marketing campaign will commence, the TVBudget state table is specified as *indeterminate*. Valid-time indeterminacy is "don't know when" indeterminacy. The table thus is specified as an INDETERMINATE table; the NONSTANDARD reserved word specifies that various distributions other than the standard one may be needed.

Let's assume hypothetically that the intelligence from the field indicates that Jamaican Brewing is planning a big market introduction of a light beer, with a budget of \$3 million, but it is not clear when it will start.

```
INSERT INTO TVBudget
VALUES ('Jamaican Brewing', 'Lowinbrew', 'NBC', 300000)
VALID '1995-01 ~ 1995-04 - 1995-06'
WITH DISTRIBUTION PROBABLY_EARLY ;
```

Literals express an indeterminate period by indicating the beginning and ending instants, either of which may be indeterminate. The literal specified for the timestamp of the inserted row specifies that the campaign may start as early as January, 1995, or as late as April 1995. Once the campaign begins, it will continue through June, 1995. The PROBABLY\_EARLY distribution is also specified; this distribution was previously defined by the data base administrator. In this distribution, earlier instants are more likely than later ones.

The underlying granularity is a MONTH; the range is 100 years. Such period timestamps, which can be stored in three 32-bit words, contain the range of dates and a probability distribution identifier for both delimiting events.

Queries on indeterminate periods take the indeterminate portion and the probability distribution into account when evaluating predicates. Such a capability is critical when making decisions based on incomplete data.

**Example 6** Which football insertions on NBC will likely come after the Lowinbrew product introduction?

```
SELECT I.*
VALID VALID(I)
FROM NBC_FB_Insertion AS I, TVBudget AS T
WHERE T.Network = 'NBC' AND T.Brand = 'Lowinbrew' AND
VALID(T) PRECEDES VALID(I) WITH PLAUSIBILITY 90
```

Since the query involves several underlying tables, but requests only particular insertions, the valid clause ensures that the data will be coupled with the appropriate timestamps.

The WITH PLAUSIBILITY construct reflects the request of "likely came after." The plausibility ranges from 1 (even remotely possibly) to 100 (definitely).

#### 6 Querying Multiple Versions

Recall that the NBC\_FB\_Insertion table has associated valid and transaction times. To this point, the transaction time has been implicitly assumed to be *now*, that is, the most up-to-date media plan. As previous versions are available, they can be queried, and compared with each other.

Previous versions are accessed by specifying predicates on their transaction time.

**Example 7** How did our monthly budget on NBC football games for the current media plan compare with that of the media plan prepared two weeks ago, which didn't take this new product introduction into account?

```
SELECT SUM(N.Cost), SUM(N2.Cost)
VALID VALID(NI)
FROM NBC_FB_Insertion AS NI NI2, NBCShows AS N N2
WHERE NI.GameName = N.ShowName AND
VALID(NI) OVERLAPS VALID(N) AND
NI2.GameName = NS2.ShowName AND
VALID(NI2) OVERLAPS VALID(N2) AND
TRANSACTION(NI2) OVERLAPS DATE 'now - 14 days' AND
TRANSACTION(N2) OVERLAPS DATE 'now - 14 days'
GROUP BY VALID(NI) USING MONTH
```

Figure 4: Comparison of Monthly Budgets Between Media Plan Versions

The corresponding TSQL2 query is displayed in Figure 4. This query compares the cost of the current media plan with that of two weeks ago, on a month-tomonth basis. Both media plans involve insertions over valid time.

This query also uses *now-relative* times, specifically DATE 'now – 14 days'. Such values can appear within a query, as here, and can also be stored in a table as a column value or as a valid time. During query evaluation, now-relative times are *bound* to specific times by substituting the current time and performing the indicated interval addition or subtraction.

330

#### 7 Changing the Schema

Schema evolution interacts with transaction time support. To illustrate how, assume that the NBC\_FB\_Insertion table was defined on February 17, 1983, using the create table statement in Section 3, then modified on June 21, 1994 as follows.

```
ALTER TABLE NBC_FB_Insertion
ADD COLUMN MediaPackage CHARACTER ( 30 ) ;
```

Since this table is timestamped with transaction time (it is also timestamped with valid time, but this aspect is not relevant to the present discussion), its schema is versioned. Previous data is potentially stored under the old schema, while newly inserted or updated data is stored consistent with the current schema.

Legacy applications are supported via the set schema time statement. If there was an application program that used the original schema, it could continue to access old data as well as current data through that schema, by specifying the following.

SET SCHEMA DATE '1993-03-01'

This states that the schema in effect as of that date should be used. If the application inserted rows into NBC\_FB\_Insertion, the value of the MediaPackage column would be a null value. Note that the schema modification statements that enable continued use of previous schemas are restricted.

#### 8 Vacuuming

If transaction time is supported for a table, that table grows monotonically, with logical deletions being implemented as physical modifications. No old data is physically deleted. For many applications, this behavior is precisely what is desired, as there may be company policies or government regulations (such as laws governing tax records) that require retension of previous data.

However, some applications may wish to periodically physically remove old data.

**Example 8** Vacuum the NBC\_FB\_Insertion table before 1990.

VACUUM NBC\_FB\_Insertion WHERE TRANSACTION(NBC\_FB\_Insertion) PRECEDES DATE '1990-01-01'

All information with a transaction time before this cutoff date is inaccessible after this statement is executed.  $\hfill \Box$ 

Current queries (those that do not mention transaction time) will not be affected, as they request the most current state, which will always be after the cutoff date. Queries that do mention transaction time should not attempt to access data updated before the cutoff date.

#### 9 Summary

In this tutorial, we have touched on the following facilities and constructs available in the consensus temporal query language TSQL2.

- *Periods* are anchored durations of time. This is a new data type, augmenting SQL's datetimes and intervals.
- *Event tables* are timestamped with sets of instants.
- *State tables* are timestamped with *temporal elements*, which are sets of periods.
- *Bitemporal tables* are timestamped with both valid time and transaction time.
- A granularity is a partitioning of the time line.
- *Calendars* provide a collection of granularities, and participate in parsing and output of timestamp literals.
- *Timestamp formats* are user-specified, allowing different applications to control how timestamps are displayed.
- *Valid-time selection* enables rows to be selected by means of predicates on their timestamps, within the where clause.
- *Valid-time projection* specifies the period of validity of a derived table, via the valid clause.
- *Coalescing* merges the timestamps of *value-equivalent* rows, and is specified by listing column names in the from clause.
- *Partitioning* extracts maximal period(s) from a temporal element timestamp for a row, and is specified via the PERIOD reserved word in the from clause.
- *Coupled correlation names* permits a further coalescing on additional columns, while ensuring that the rows associated with the two correlation names agree on the values of the original coalescing columns.
- Conventional (non-time-varying) tables can be derived from time-varying tables by specifying snapshot in the select clause. Conventional tables can also participate along with time-varying tables in a select statement.
- *Time-varying aggregates* can be computed. Grouping can be over columns or over row timestamps.
- *Temporal indeterminacy* is supported in the data model, via instant timestamps that encode the first and last possible occurrence times, as well as a probability distribution, and in the query language, via a with plausibility phrase in the where clause.

- Transaction-time selection permits specification of previous versions.
- *Now-relative times* are bound during query evaluation.
- *Schema versioning* allows tables timestamped with transaction time to be accessed and modified through previous schemas, thereby supporting legacy applications.
- Tables timestamped with transaction time may be *vacuumed* to remove old versions.

#### Acknowledgements

The domain expertise of Merrie L. Brucks was critical in developing this example, and her assistance is greatly appreciated.

#### References

- Jensen (ed.), C. S. "A Consensus Test Suite of Temporal Database Queries." Technical Report R 93-2034. Department of Mathematics and Computer, Institute for Electronic Systems. Nov. 1993.
- [2] Snodgrass, R. T., (editor) "An Evaluation of TSQL2." Commentary. TSQL2 Design Committee. Sep. 1994.
- [3] Jensen, C. S., R. T. Snodgrass and M. D. Soo. "Extending Normal Forms to Temporal Relations." TR 92-17. Computer Science Department, University of Arizona. July 1992.